

## **BOOK REVIEWS**



von Benda-Beckmann, Keebet and Fernanda Pirie (eds.). 2007. *Order and Disorder: Anthropological Perspectives*. Oxford and New York: Berghahn Publishers. 184 pp. Hb: \$75.00 / £35.00. ISBN: 9781845451981.

*Order and Disorder: Anthropological Perspectives* is the outcome of a conference of that name held at the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology in 2004. The volume consists of an editors' introduction and eight ethnographic chapters, with contributors including both established and younger scholars. These empirical cases range widely in scope and regional focus, from a study of the way 'heritage' is evoked to establish legitimacy in the French biscuit trade (Simon Roberts) to the intersection of multiple, and sometimes competing normative orders in rural Morocco (Bertram Turner), to the emergence of complex and potentially violent forms of social control in post-Soviet Siberia (Aimar Ventsel). The individual ethnographic chapters are rich and illuminating. However, like many conference collections, the volume as a whole feels rather disparate. 'Order' and 'disorder' are mobilised to do very different kinds of descriptive and analytical work in the respective ethnographies; the chapters, by and large, do not reference each other or the introduction; and it is not clear that they are really engaged in a single conversation. Whilst some of the chapters are clearly advancing the editors' concern to rethink the analytical utility of 'order' and to reflect critically on how it is known and rendered visible ethnographically, others are posing rather more traditional anthropological questions concerning what the sources of order are, and how it is maintained.

In the introduction, editors Keebet von Benda-Beckmann and Fernanda Pirie explain that their concern to reinvestigate these categories emerged in response to a particular historical silence. The question of 'order', they argue, was the object of considerable theoretical attention in an earlier era of anthropology but has been displaced by more recent attention to 'the violent, the illegitimate and the immoral' (p.1). This eclipse, they suggest, demands that we reconsider the conceptual relevance of both 'order' and 'disorder'. Is order still meaningful as an object of anthropological enquiry, and as a category of analysis? And how useful are earlier theoretical models, with their more explicit concern with the maintenance of order 'outside' the state for understanding contemporary social processes in which the state is unquestionably present (if only by its absence or decay)?

These conceptual questions are addressed most directly in the volume's dazzling final chapter, by Jonathan Spencer. This chapter begins by echoing the concern that frames the introduction – the striking displacement of 'order' as a focus of anthropological enquiry; the shift since the 1960s from a 'concern with social order to the celebration of the unruly capacities of disorder' (p. 150), particularly within the subfield of political anthropology. Spencer contests the claim, however, that the shift is as straightforward or unidirectional as it might first appear. A celebration of 'disorder', he argues, has often gone hand in hand with a kind of ethical conservatism – a 'high moral and political tone, a striving for radical certainty' (p. 163). He illustrates this through examples from contemporary (mostly North American) political anthropology, with Michael Taussig and Nancy Scheper-Hughes as his exemplars and primary targets. What has occurred, he

argues, is less a complete rejection of 'order' than its displacement from the realm of sociological observation to ethical sentiment. This move, he contends, reflects a particular political moment and associated 'structure of feeling', just as the empiricism of an earlier generation of political anthropology reflected its own historical moment.

Here, I believe, lie the volume's real innovation and potential theoretical contribution – pointing to the ways in which 'order' has been displaced from the political realm to the ethical; locating this within broader shifts in anthropological theorising and the political contexts of its production, and reassessing the potential for 'order' in the sociological sense to regain some ethnographic utility (albeit nuanced, as the editors stress in their introduction, by a recognition that the term can reference a variety of domains and be enacted in a variety of ways – including through the sanctioning of violence). The potential of this theoretical contribution is constrained, however, by the fact that most of the contributions do not treat 'order' with this degree of conceptual inquisitiveness, but rather take it as the largely unproblematic starting point for ethnographic exploration. The questions posed, accordingly, are of a different register: how is order maintained through the interaction of different legal and normative spheres (Bertram Turner)? How is order maintained in contexts of harsh climactic conditions, economic free-fall and dramatic state retreat (Aimar Ventsel)? What is the relationship between 'state order' and 'social order' and how are they inter-twined (Michael Meeker)? How do ritual and law overlap in their respective 'fetishizations' of order (Peter Just)? How do different vigilante groups in West Africa either create instability or help to create social order in the face of a weak state (Tilo Grätz)? And how to account for the diversity of ways in which order is valorised and enforced among settled and nomadic populations on the Tibetan plateau (Fernanda Pirie)?

These are interesting questions – and the ethnographies through which they are explored are rich, nuanced and highly readable. But given that they do not, for the most part, interrogate the baseline analytic category (is 'order' a useful concept to work with? Does it explain as well as describe?) the ethnographies bypass the concerns outlined in the editors' introduction. More challengingly, it is not clear that they are really talking about comparable things – and this is where the question of the coherence of the volume as a volume comes in. Is the 'order' entailed by an absence of violence, for instance, really the same as the subjective feeling of security that some of the other ethnographies access? More importantly, if the term can index such diverse social formations and subjective states, does the category 'order' help to explain what is being produced? Is the fact that we habitually use one English term to index a state that is produced ('an order'), the process of its production ('to order') and a certain *idea* about how things ought to be ('right order') mean that we risk over-burdening the term, or voiding it of analytic capacity? My concern is that we do. This is not to say that we should not seek to understand how 'order' functions as an ethnographic category: how and when certain ideas of legitimate and illegitimate violence are mobilised, and to what effect. It is rather that the organising categories, 'order' and 'disorder' may be less useful to understand what is going on than other, less capacious, analytical terms. Pirie's detailed comparison of the differential valence of violence, individualism and social control amongst pastoralist and settled agricultural

communities on the Tibetan plateau is, I think, exemplary of what such an undertaking might look like. In conclusion, then, this is a rich collection of ethnographies, but the theoretical challenge laid by the opening chapter to explore the analytic value of ‘order’ and ‘disorder’ remains rather unfulfilled.

MADELEINE REEVES

*University of Manchester (UK)*

Sather, Clifford and Timo Kaartinen (eds.). 2008. *Beyond the Horizon. Essays on Myth, History, Travel and Society*. Helsinki: Finnish Literature Society. 240 pp. Pb.: EUR 29.00. ISBN: 9789517469852.

This is the second volume in the *Studia Fennica Anthropologica* series, founded in 2007. The book honours a well-known Finnish anthropologist, Jukka Siikala, on the occasion of his 60th birthday. The *fil rouge* connecting the introduction, eleven essays and an afterword circles around the concept of horizon in every possible sense of the term. For Professor Siikala, horizon became a central idea, around which one could perceive the life-worlds of Polynesian island societies. He sees their horizon as an aspect of time (mainly of the past) as well as of space (abroad and beyond). While on the one hand horizon reveals its transcendental and transpositional potential, on the other hand, it points towards the limits of ethnographic observation. Horizon connects visible with invisible domains of human life and empirical sensual experience with the one that moves beyond it.

There are three parts in this collection of essays. Each of them reflects a different dimension of people’s experiential and symbolic awareness of their life-worlds: the first part deals with people who live in the rainforest and feel the need to transcend their horizons; the second part looks at the people living on the islands with a distant horizon, towards which both navigation and cosmology are oriented; and the third part deals with myths, texts and performances reaching beyond the horizon of people’s daily relationships and interactions. Individual chapters touch upon a variety of geographic areas in the Pacific and address quite diverse issues. The first part begins with an essay by Joel Robbins who analyses the impact of Christian cosmology, and millenarianism in particular, on the Urapmin of Papua New Guinea. He sees their structure-agency dialectic as aiming towards discontinuity: a radical rapture from the culturally conceived forms. According to Robbins, their lives are organized mainly around the future, which makes them – through an emphasis on moral practice – escape from their earthly preoccupations towards an undifferentiated heaven: a foreign country in a world beyond all countries. The second essay by Peter Metcalf looks at the Long Teru people who used to live in the rainforest of central Borneo. In such an environment visual horizons are practically nonexistent and directions are conceptualized according to the flow of the river: upriver, downriver, away from the river, towards the river. Metcalf deals with people’s cosmological and spatial orientations from the time of his fieldwork, before the Long Teru, also called Orang Ulu or the canoe people, had to move – after the rainforests of central Borneo were devastated by logging – downriver towards the coast. There they joined other longhouse communities

under the common identity of the Upriver People. The death of their physical and cultural environment is highly symbolic and more disconcerting once one realizes that according to their cosmology it was the dead who travelled downriver towards the sea. In the third essay Clifford Sather analyses a curing ritual, the great Gawai Betawai, among the Saribas Iban. The Iban shaman has to master both mystic and mundane aspects of life, which are combined in this ritual. In the pertaining songs, the world beyond the horizon, i.e. the one of no ordinary experience, is surprisingly portrayed in familiar or rather identical terms to the ordinary one.

Part One ends with Roy Wagner, who in a non-linear and characteristically associative manner wanders between the rainbow and the cassowary, between pretending to be dead and pretending to be alive, between the Daribi of New Guinea and the whites, between concepts of 'two' and 'half' (the Daribi number-marker *si* means both), and between the fact and the reverie.

Part Two opens with a chapter by Anthony Hooper remembering sixteen days of skipjack fishing on the Tokelau atoll of Fakaofu in 1971, and the parts the elders and the young played in it. The next contribution is by Jukka's son Harri. He presents Polynesian 'total social bodies', the house and the canoe, as the key symbols of cosmological dialectic between stasis and mobility. While Samoans claim to be autochthonous people, a conviction that is also emphasised in their myths, and see the house and the land as being those that define their identity, the societies of Eastern Polynesia construct their identity around canoes and stories of migration. Frederick Damon's study focuses on the *Callophylum* tree species, which is, in the Milne Bay Province of Papua New Guinea, used for making outrigger sailing crafts. These boats are moving metaphors seen in the societies of Kula ring as syntheses of complex relationships. There is an appealing parallel text running mainly in the footnotes addressing the struggles and disagreements regarding the identification of different *Callophylum* species between the author, the people, and Peter Stevens, the authority on the genus. In the last chapter of this part James Fox explores how the ideas about the sun, moon, and sea are linked to growth, fertility and order, and how they were once ritually celebrated on the island of Roti in eastern Indonesia.

Part Three begins with a chapter by Judith Huntsman. She looks at the semi-autobiographical account by the late Tokelau traditionalist Peato Tutu Perez. In this unusual vernacular text, he wrote about the first forty years of the 20th century on the Fakaofu atoll and the tensions between the Samoan pastor from the Protestant London Missionary Society, the Catholics, and himself, a spokesman for the Catholic minority. Jukka's Ph.D. student Petra Autio writes about Kiribati dance and lyrics, and how they should not be seen as merely representing something but rather as making things happen. Timo Kaartinen's essay about two myths from the Great Kai Island of Southern Maluku in eastern Indonesia concludes the third part of this volume. Bruce Kapferer's short afterword suggests that the book is about cosmologies (a more dynamic concept), their cosmogenic and regenerative powers, and their intimate relation to cultures (a more static concept). Praising the studies based on a long-term ethnographic fieldwork and deep historical insight, he argues – as he has also done in some recently published articles – against

recent reconfigurations of anthropology, which gave rise to ‘presentism’ and ‘cosmology of capital’.

The lived world is always created against the horizon: of time, space, custom, practice, saying, longing, dreaming, and so on. People’s daily lives and their horizons are in a creative dialectical relation. At the same time they overlap and come together into a kind of cosmological unity. It is there that time and space cross, that visible and invisible merge, that distinction between perception and expression is blurred, and movement and stasis become two sides of the same coin. This ethnographically rich book, which will especially please the area studies specialists, is a very suitable contribution in terms of honouring the ‘big man’ who has always recognized the importance of extended anthropological fieldwork and the value of ethnography.

BORUT TELBAN

*Scientific Research Centre of the Slovenian Academy of Sciences and Arts  
and  
University of Nova Gorica (Slovenia)*

Smith, Anthony D. 2008. *The Cultural Foundations of Nations: Hierarchy, Covenant, and Republic*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell Publishing. x-xv + 264 pp. Pb.: EUR 27.00 / £19.99. ISBN: 81405177986.

In the extensive field of the study of nations a more recent development has been the question of the chronology of nations. With his new book, Anthony D. Smith sets out to contribute to the historical sociology of nations by examining ‘certain types of the public cultures of nations’ (p. ix) – namely hierarchy, covenant, and republic. Smith’s main thesis is that those historical forms of the analytic category of nation emerged in successive historical periods and are furthermore influenced by traditions of public cultures stemming from antiquity. Here, he also revises to some extent his own theory of the ethnic origins of nations by recognising other factors that contribute to the formation of this type of cultural and/or political community.

The backdrop of Smith’s line of argument is provided by the modernist view that the emergence of nations and nationalisms dates back to the late 18<sup>th</sup> century, with the French Revolution as the pivotal moment, and that it is very closely connected to the development of industrial capitalism. It is exactly that conception of considering nations as a creation of modernity and the ideological movement of nationalism, thus producing an ideal-type of nation that Smith challenges throughout the book. The shortcomings arising from the modernist restriction of the analytical field to the modern ‘mass nation’ are, if nothing else, the exclusion of other historical forms of community and collective identity, apart from the fact that the notion is a problematic one due to its inherent eurocentrism.

Before setting out to explore historical varieties of nation or community in-depth, Smith devotes the first three chapters of his book to a thorough theoretical overview that

is largely motivated by his criticism of modernist theory. The basic assumption for his analysis of processes of nation formation he elaborates most are the ‘cultural underpinnings’ of collective political identities, namely the myths and symbols of ethnic or ethnoreligious communities (p. 29). At this point, Smith introduces three subcategories of ethnic communities – ethnic categories, ethnic networks, and *ethnie* – that remain, however, somewhat loosely-defined due to their drawing on a very broad concept of ethnicity, but lead nevertheless to the thesis that most nations can be considered a specific development of ethnic communities. As the most important of all the categories and distinctions, he introduces his own definition of an ideal-typical nation in the theoretical chapters. This definition is the guide for his subsequent argument and seeks to overcome the flaws of modernist theory by emphasising the nature of the nation as ‘felt’ community with shared myths and a distinctive public culture.

That theoretical background provided, Smith’s quest for a ‘cultural “genealogy” of nations’ (p. 48) starts back in antiquity, a period that in his opinion can provide the historical framework necessary for this endeavour. Here, he draws on examples such as the Egyptian empire, the Sumerian city states, or ancient Judah to trace the relevant processes of nation formation that might have exerted an influence on later nations. The strongest impact is ascribed to religious concepts that contained myths of sacred kingship – in Smith’s view a prerequisite for the hierarchical nation – and, in the case of Judah, myths of an elected people that became the basis for the later covenantal nations.

His in-depth analysis of the sacred order of hierarchical nations is supported by rich historical material focusing mainly on processes in Russia, the Near East, and Western Europe. Again, Smith’s argument refers to the standard definition of the nation by modernists that he seeks to dispute to some extent. A comparison of the nature of kingdoms such as France and England to exactly those criteria and his own ideal definition of the nation leads him to the conclusion that one could indeed be speaking of ‘pre-modern nations’ (p. 105). Even more: ‘Once we accept that “nationhood” and “modernization” are only contingently related, then we can see that not only may there be nations which radically differ from the standard Western concept, but that our modern concept of the nation is in need of considerable revision’ (ibid).

The same implication could also apply to the later development of covenantal nations. Smith’s main focus here is dating the emergence of national identities and nationalisms. The ideological movement of Reformation allowed for the populace to be involved, thus extending feelings of national identity from the elites to the broader masses. Furthermore, Smith speaks of ‘covenantal nationalism’ (p. 132) manifested not only in the strong religious bonds but especially in the drive for unity and autonomy in Calvinist theory or the Covenants of Scotland and the Netherlands. Smith especially depicts the political component of ‘covenantal nationalisms’ that are in his view not unlike its later secular equivalents.

However, the solely secular doctrine of later civic-republican nationalism notwithstanding, Smith states that it was not only enforced with an almost religious fervour, but assumed an ethnic community and cultural unity at the basis of the nation, thus also drawing on the legacy of antiquity and its public cultures. In the last part of the book, in

which he discusses the republican nation and the alternative destinies of modern nations, Smith widens the scope of his analysis to other examples such as Africa, Iran, or Japan to show how different models of the nation are often combined or transformed over time.

With *The Cultural Foundations of Nations*, Smith provides the reader with a new approach to the chronology of nations, substantiated by rich historical material and a concise line of argument. His previous findings on the ethnic and sacred roots of the nation blend together to form a bold effort of challenging prevailing views that the emergence of nations depended on modernity alone, thereby broadening the analytical concept of nation to a whole variety of human associations.

CHRISTIANE ADAMCZYK

*Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology (Germany)*

Werbner, Pnina. 2008. *Anthropology and the New Cosmopolitanism Rooted, Feminist and Vernacular Perspectives*. Oxford and New York: Berg Publishers. 384 pp. Hb.: \$109.95. ISBN: 9781847881977.

*Anthropology and the New Cosmopolitanism Rooted, Feminist and Vernacular Perspectives* is the product of the Association of Social Anthropologists of the UK and the Commonwealth Diamond Jubilee conference held in 2006. This volume sets itself with the goal of inaugurating a new anthropology of cosmopolitanism which, in its practice and substantive terms, is a *situated* cosmopolitanism (p. 1). Werbner suggests that in its basic form cosmopolitanism stands for approaching cultural differences throughout dialogue, respect, aesthetic enjoyment and in the stress of living together with difference. She emphasizes that whether elite, vernacular or rooted, '...cosmopolitanism has to be grasped as an ethical horizon – an aspirational outlook and mode of practice. Cosmopolitans insist on the human capacity to imagine the world from an Other's perspective, and to imagine the possibility of a borderless world of cultural plurality' (p. 2). This timely volume, consisting of 17 chapters, is divided into five sections that offer a wide range of ethnographic accounts and comparative perspectives on the trans-local belonging in a globalizing world. In the Introduction, Pnina Werbner stresses that the new cosmopolitan anthropology rejects two main misconceptions about cosmopolitanism. The first is the assumption that postcolonial elites are necessarily corrupt and rootless; the second is that cosmopolitanism is singular and elitist.

Section One, 'Anthropology as a Cosmopolitan Discipline' sets the theoretical framework for the volume. All chapters in this section are concerned with social anthropology as cosmopolitan in theory and practice. The main emphasis is that social anthropology has been involved in the analysis of transcultural systems from the early days of the discipline. This argument is set against the view that anthropology is just another expression of Western hegemony.

Section Two, is concerned with feminism, human rights and anti-violence strategies as non-violent, cosmopolitan projects. Maila Stevens argues that, despite growing literature

on cosmopolitanism, there has been a lack of study on gender and cosmopolitanism. She explores Islamic feminists in Malaysia and Indonesia and their political activism and lobbying as a cosmopolitan project. In her chapter, Kathryn Robinson is also concerned with the development of Indonesian Muslim feminism. Robinson explores the extent to which Indonesian Muslim women scholars and political leaders create alliances with similar movements throughout the Muslim world in order to address a range of issues from domestic violence and polygamy to ethnic violence against women. Kalpana Ram explores local cosmopolitanism for Dalit Christian women, which both is related to and inspired by modernist cosmopolitan values. Ram argues for phenomenological groundings of cosmopolitanism in the flow of feelings in relation to an Other.

Section Three, explore notions of vernacular and rooted cosmopolitanisms. Aref Abu Rabia explores ‘multiplicity of roots’ and ‘layers of identifications’, arguing for a rooted cosmopolitanism in the context of separation generated by the Middle East conflict. Richard Werbner scrutinizes the place of minority elites in new postcolonial nations and their efforts to guard vernacular cultural values, while themselves being educated world travellers. In a similar way, Eric Hirsch’s chapter examines rooted cosmopolitans which are concerned with vernacular cultural ideals in order to transcend them and claim broader cosmopolitan values.

The Section Four offers more examples of vernacular and rooted cosmopolitanisms. Particularly interesting is the Richard Fardon’s chapter on Nigeria, where he argues that nation itself is perceived as ‘cosmopolitan nation’. The discussion of ethnically plural nations is extended in Joel S. Kahn’s chapter on Malaysia. Kahn shows that non-secular, but democratic Malaysia with its constitutional definition of rigid religio-ethnic separation has a long history of regional migration which is constantly producing a fluid and hybrid sense of Malayness. Thus Kahn argues that despite nationalist narratives of Malay indignity and purity, all Malays are to some extent *peranakan* (creole).

The fifth and final section is concerned with working class cosmopolitanisms and cosmopolitans. Owen Sichone’s chapter celebrates demotic cosmopolitanism in the exploration of migrants who travel without visas or passports or without any particular destinations. This chapter makes an important contribution to the scholarship seeking to shift the focus in migration studies from labour migration and refugees to independent ‘economic’ migrants.

The book concludes with a conversation that Pnina Werbner conducted with Stuart Hall. This makes a particularly important contribution to the volume with Hall’s emphasis on contemporary transnational movements as largely driven by civil wars, natural disasters, and the search for economic benefits - in one word, by *necessity*. This superb book is a welcome addition to contemporary discussions about transnational belonging, rootedness, patriotism, and anthropology as a situated, cosmopolitan practice. It will immediately become the most important reference point for all interested in varieties of cosmopolitanism in the contemporary world.

ANA DRAGOJLOVIC

*RSPAS, The Australian National University (Australia)*

---

Lindholm, Charles. 2008. *Culture and Authenticity*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell. 184 pp. Pb.: £16.99/EUR 23.00. ISBN: 9781405124430.

In *Culture and Authenticity*, Charles Lindholm provides a sweeping overview of the concept of authenticity as it has been used in anthropology, cultural studies, and related fields. He approaches authenticity from a number of different perspectives, both personal and collective, examining how, historically and cross-culturally, the quest for authenticity has emerged as a search for meaning in a world rife with contrivance. Ambitiously, Lindholm attempts to tackle the difficult philosophical concept of authenticity as it applies to such diverse topics as art, music, food, ethnicity and identity.

The introduction provides a brief definition of authentic objects, persons, and collectives as ‘original, real, and pure; they are what they purport to be, their roots are known and verified, their essence and appearance are one’ (p. 2). Many other publications explore the diverse philosophical aspects of the concept in much greater detail, and it is thus unnecessary for Lindholm to wade through these same waters. Still, it is surprising that he does not here acknowledge that the anthropological understanding of authenticity is more complex than his short introduction suggests; indeed, the very relevance of authenticity as an essential quality is much debated. However, his definition is sufficient for the broad, case study-based approach Lindholm undertakes.

In Part One, which deals with personal authenticity, Lindholm explores authenticity in terms of art, music, and travel, and then turns to a discussion of the commodification of authenticity and self-definition. The first three chapters explore their topics along parallel paths - art and relics (and tourist experiences) venerated for their ‘aura’ (p. 13), the cult of the aesthetic and of the artist/genius (p. 16), the ‘problem’ of commodification (p. 18), the importance of ‘emotional essence’ (p. 27), and a fear of mistaking the manufactured for the real (p.41). Lindholm then examines the economic aspects of authenticity, wherein greater prestige and higher prices are accorded to authentic goods as compared to mass manufactured knockoffs. He reflects on the voracious appetite of consumers, asserting that the consumption of commodified authenticity provides anxious buyers with a sense of autonomy, control, community, and status (p. 64). In the final chapter of this section, Lindholm delves deeper into the psychological aspects of defining the self and finding personal meaning through the quest for authenticity.

In Part Two, which explores the collective aspects of authenticity, Lindholm looks at the role of authenticity in building and validating national and ethnic identity. The process may not be ‘natural;’ he notes how, for example, Belizeans ‘invented’ a national cuisine, later reified and defended as authentic Belizean culture. He also explores the often homogenizing effects of creating a national cuisine or dance in an ethnically diverse polity, and the intentional redefinition of what it means to belong - wherein people recognize the symbolic capital and political power wielded in claiming a unique and authentic national identity (p. 91).

In illustrating the relationship between authenticity and nationalism, Lindholm turns to Israel as a case study to illuminate the ways in which ‘the quest for an essential authenticity has been intertwined with the rise of a nation-state, and how both have been

transformed over time due to internal and external circumstances' (p. 112). Finally, Lindholm shifts perspective to look at authenticity in nation-making from the point of view of those on the margins. Here he demonstrates how the shame of being excluded can be turned on its head as 'the stigmatized collective can be exhumed and reaffirmed through the discovery of lost ancestors and common lineages' (p. 125). In this, not only culture but genetics may be utilized to validate belonging to the collective. Lindholm concludes that although collective identities (as defined by their essential authentic characteristics) are historically constructed, internally complex, and inevitably divided, this does not detract from their relevance for those who embrace such identities (p. 143). This notion is a theoretical strength of Lindholm's overall argument about why ideas about authenticity have resonance for individuals and groups.

*Culture and Authenticity* provides the reader with a compelling argument for how ideas about authenticity are relevant and meaningful for individuals and collectives who may otherwise feel a sense of alienation and insignificance in a socio-culturally complex world. The book is sensibly organized; chapters often revisit themes introduced earlier, providing a sense of continuity to the reader. It is an accessible book, which could appeal not only to specialists in anthropology or cultural studies, but to the interested layperson as well. This text would be useful for introducing undergraduates to the study of authenticity as an anthropological subject; Lindholm's inclusion of timely and provocative examples would likely generate animated classroom discussion.

The drawback in attempting to provide a sweeping overview of such a complex, multifaceted concept is that none of the various cases or perspectives are dealt with in great depth; it is an impossible challenge to provide a thorough discussion of so many different topics in a short introductory text. For example, Lindholm uses country music as a way to represent the difference between the 'popular' and the 'traditional' (p. 31). However, this short examination of the genre is by necessity cursory and largely conjectural. The nature of such a far-reaching book demands some generalizing and speculation, which sometimes compromises the robustness of Lindholm's argument.

This book's strengths, on the other hand, are that it provides a wide-reaching overview of authenticity as it is often understood in western and other cultures, and how it can be used to achieve particular personal and political goals. Lindholm astutely points out the paradoxes inherent in the concept of authenticity, and makes a compelling case for why authenticity matters. Through his examples from a variety of cultural and historical contexts, he effectively outlines how individuals and collectives may use authenticity to provide meaning and establish value for objects and experiences, and how authenticity may be used for identity creation and affirmation in the nationalist project. Lindholm provides a persuasive and readable introduction to the topic, and those seeking a greater depth of analysis can start with the lengthy bibliography Lindholm has compiled.

MICHELLE MACCARTHY  
*University of Auckland (New Zealand)*

McLean, Athena and Annette Leibing (eds.). 2007. *The Shadow side of Fieldwork. Exploring the Blurred Borders between Ethnography and Life*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. 328 pp. Pb.: £22.99 / EUR 31.10. ISBN: 9781405169813.

What do the editors mean by 'shadow'? The foreword and introduction explain their discomfort with modernity's assumption of an objective reality that still constitutes the production of knowledge in a male-dominated, academic world. Its basic dichotomy between subjectivity and objectivity invokes a series of oppositions, such as life versus work, participation versus observation, personal versus political, interior versus exterior, and experience versus representation. Their aim, however, is not merely to highlight the inevitability and importance of the former positions, often discarded as 'feminine', soft, and unscientific. Rather, they have invited authors to reflect on the twilight-zones that lie between and beyond these oppositions, that is, within the intersubjective, social process of researcher and other, and behind or underlying these relationships, hidden within the individual selves of researcher and researched. To shed light on these realms is to bring feelings, intuitions, memories, expectations to the fore, which tend to be ignored or circumvented – consciously or unconsciously – in positivist-oriented research, but nevertheless guide, sometimes inspire, sometimes restrict, the anthropological encounter. Awareness of and reflexivity on these dark sides are not to promote a renewed romanticism of the exotic other, nor narcissistic navel-gazing on behalf of the researcher. On the contrary, their disclosure is to deepen the theoretical, epistemological, and methodological soils of fieldwork, and the moral/ethical grounds on which ethnographic knowledge should rest.

The result of their call is a dozen accounts by authors of varying experience and expertise, loosely organized into five parts according to specific sets of oppositions and realms. These chapters turn out not simply to be illuminating. The courageously displayed intimacy and proximity in those texts evoke an embodied readership. They touch, arouse respect, empathy, anger, and smiles, at times also estrangement, as the authors take the reader to the heart of their encounters, with their selves and others.

Take, for instance, Alisse Waterston and Barbara Rylko-Bauer, and Anne Lovell, struggling with secrecy and silence. In each of the cases they present, the silence of their informants was not broken by words. Not words of persuasion, nor historical and political justifications to probe into their most intimate sphere, nor well-intended curiosity, but – paradoxically – silence itself made their secrets come out, in the respected silence of a mother choosing her own time, the respect of a father for his independent daughter after four years of silence, in the silence of Lovell's own secrecy, noted and appreciated by her interviewee. These accounts not only offer valuable methodological insights by de-emphasizing the importance of the spoken word in interviewing, but teach foremost lessons of respect.

Vincent Crapanzano and Thomas Csordas reach toward realities beyond what can be grasped empirically, objectively. The shades they describe, whether as a felt collectivity that may initiate collective feeling and intersubjective knowing, or as spontaneous instances of empathy and intuition that connect the ethnographer with others, are as real to their informants as they become to the ethnographer when allowing

himself to be immersed in their symbolic and material worlds. These realities are not 'delusions' only because are beyond rational comprehension, but realms that his body experiences, senses, against all (minded) odds.

Jason Szabo and Annette Leibling expose the easily neglected historicity of epistemologies. The former illuminates the social, medical, and personal biographies in the history of American hospices, the latter the influence of personal and professional trajectories, to bring in retrospect to light what until then had remained invisible, unexpressed, and therefore unknown. Nancy Scheper-Hughes, Meira Weiss, and Rose-Marie Chierici take this lesson into the contemporaneity of the quite upsetting politics of their respective fields. Theirs are advocacies of personal and emotional involvement, which, as they argue, cannot and should not be avoided in order to acknowledge and voice the Other's humanity. In particular, Weiss's brave account gives a disturbing insight in the necessity and inevitability of an interplay between distance and proximity in forensic examinations of dead bodies in Israel, and between professional and personal positioning that confront her with ethical dilemmas of loyalty towards her country and truthfulness towards her discipline.

The chapters by Dimitris Papageorgiou, Ellen Corin, and Athena McLean, in contrast, stress that it is not the researcher but the researched who determines the development and outcome of investigations. It is the football hooligan or musician who decides on the access and quality of relationship; the psychotic and their caretakers in Zaire, Canada and India are ones who administer social inclusion and exclusion, countering the western view of their 'marginality'. The nurses, physicians, administrators, and elderly suffering from dementia are the ones who, willingly or unwillingly, force the ethnographer to take sides. The fieldworker is left but to deal with the partial views the positions adjusted to him/her inevitably entail.

At first, I must admit, I felt weary of yet another project revolting against modernity's positivist stances, to read again an urging to combine in order to transcend the dichotomies it implies. The extensive theoretical and methodological explanations and justifications for approaching the shadows, in effect, create a reinforcement of the hegemony of those very (binary) oppositions that still seem to direct our understanding of the ethnographic field. Defence, in the process of guarding ourselves, has to acknowledge the very power and strength it seeks to resist. Besides, after having been drawn emotionally and intellectually into these lucid and transparent accounts, towards both researcher and researched, I started to wonder what, in fact, is shadow and what light. If these descriptions of so-called twilight-zones arouse what should be the very essence of the ethnographic method, isn't it time by now to take modernity's 'blindness' out of its parentheses, and to dismiss the two centuries that have passed since 'Enlightenment' as the second 'Dark Age' in western history for good?

YOLANDA VANEDE

*University of Amsterdam (Netherlands)*

Schäuble, Michaela. 2006. *Wiedergänger, Grenzgänger, Doppelgänger. Rites de Passage in Bram Stokers Dracula*. Berlin: Lit Verlag. 152 pp. Pb.: EUR 19.90. ISBN: 3825869768.

Since its publication in 1897, Bram Stoker's *Dracula*, the tale of a trusty band of vampire-hunted-turned-vampire-hunters, has set the clichéd example of what and how a vampire should be in the imagination of the masses. Often copied but never excelled its main protagonist, Count Dracula, remains one of the most mysterious and horrifying characters in fictional literature. Michaela Schäuble's analysis of the same book, *Wiedergänger, grenzgänger, doppelgänger* (which can at best be translated as *Revenant(s), borderliner(s), double(s)*), reveals how Bram Stoker managed to create this picture by analyzing the text-production and cultural patterns underlying the themes of the book. Her thorough investigation depicts the masterpiece of British gothic horror tales in terms of how abnormality is produced and reproduced throughout the novel's characters, and by showing how the author used language and text to manipulate the reader through what he reads. Initially written as her master-thesis in both cultural/social anthropology and comparative literature-studies at the University of Tübingen, Germany, Schäuble's *résumé* interprets the figures, drama, form and vocabulary of *Dracula* under aspects of liminality and 'otherness'. It combines psycho-analytical with post-structural-literary interpretations of *Dracula*, joining these with cross-cultural, anthropological interpretations of *rites-de-passages* inherent to the text.

Schäuble opens with a brief introduction on worldwide historical and contemporary beliefs of revenants and recounts vampire-like figures in Mediterranean societies, concentrating on their role as an 'un-dead' living between worlds. According to her, vampires are a 'key-concept of our cultural symbolism', resembling an 'epitome of the other, that which has become unclear and mysterious "by questioning" the conventional distinction between human and monster, normality and the abnormal, life and death, between the self and the other' (p. 9).

She divides her work into two major parts. In the first, she analyses three underlying levels of Stoker's text: '*writing the vampire*', '*reading the vampire*', and '*desiring the vampire*'. By deciphering the modes of language and literary strategies Stoker used, it is shown how the monstrous figure of Dracula is 'constructed and made understandable' (pp. 20-42). As we follow Schäuble into the depths of *Dracula* we realize that the most horrifying aspects in Stokers tale lie outside of what is representable through language. The epistolary novel's fragmentary arrangement of various pieces of manuscript and the poly-perspective narration reflect the unwariness and gaps in the memory and perception of the novel's human characters, leaving the reader interpretational freedom to imagine the unspeakable. Only by rearranging their fragmentary knowledge of their past memories, and the denotative image, character and moves of the vampire into written sentences, can the protagonists grasp and handle what they have actually experienced: 'As I must do something or go mad, I write this diary', the main character Jonathan Harker notes after his escape from Dracula's castle.

Referring to a multitude of sources, from Sigmund Freud to Jacques Lacan to later psychoanalytical readings of *Dracula*, Schäuble also explains the dimensions of

symbolical analogies inherent to the many sexual motives behind the storyline. Dracula himself uses his own sexual 'print', with which he opposes the manly authority of the vampire-hunters as a primal fatherly figure that is hated and later defeated for his power over the women/mother.

In turn, the men themselves 'write' upon the female vampires – often including more sexual implications, such as the permutation of stake-pencil-phallus that simultaneously 'stabs'/rapes and 'writes' upon the female vampires. The author follows Jacques Derrida by applying a 'post-structural eye' on *Dracula* to 'read the vampire', (p. 43-60), its signs and the difference between the way Dracula is created and what he symbolizes. The revenant can be seen as 'character' or 'letter' who 'writes himself' on other living beings. As Dracula tries to apply the British way of life by copying the behaviour of his victims, most of whom are also wanderers between worlds – Van Helsing, for example 'walks the frontiers between the nations and languages as well as between tradition and modernity' (p. 94) – the vampire-hunters use the count's own weapons against him by mimicking his actions, applying his tactics and writing them down again – a strategy found in many ritual representations of distress in both traditional and contemporary societies, e.g. through masquerades and obsession.

*Dracula* also articulates restrained and hidden fears of both individuals and of British Victorian society in general, including those of the unknown, the fears of losing clear boundaries, and of the expression of sexual intemperance. Stoker, as Schäuble explains in one of many informative footnotes, was an observer of Freud's earliest psychoanalytical publications. According to Freud, the myths of horror and psychoanalysis serve the same purpose, namely to depict the hidden and suppressed (p. 56). By reflecting on 'vampirism, female sexuality and death', Schäuble further shows us *Dracula* also functions as a reference for potential dark sides of the characters (pp. 62-75). Facing the vampire that mimics them, indicating the hunters are confronted with a mirror of their own intimate wishes and detested characteristics, consequently also '*desiring the vampire*' who lives out what they cannot.

In the second half of her book, Schäuble figures the deeper anthropological meaning behind the ever reoccurring key-concept of liminality and borders in *Dracula*. By using Julia Kristeva's concept of a female-attributed *semiotic* unstableness penetrating a stable *symbolic* order of the (paternal) self, referring to a yearning for death, Schäuble illustrates parallels in both society and *Dracula*'s storyline. A special focus of the second part lies on how *rites-de-passage* such as births, weddings and death, and, here especially, second burials (with death being the 'final frontier' to cross), find their textual representations in the motifs and strategies used in Stokers novel and the rituals of social security. Such frightful rituals, found in many traditional as well as contemporary societies, often occur in conditions of crises, tensions and conflict. Through imitation and the narration of border-crossing, disturbing factors are 'depicted on a symbolical level', bonded, and placed into a social structure.

*Wiedergänger* is a densely-packed, slightly non-linear, all-in-all fascinating account, which sometimes leaves the reader wandering between chapters as earlier-mentioned motifs are often deepened, compared or analysed again for their differing

references. Providing a good bibliography, Schäuble's book provides a detailed overview on common Dracula-interpretations, complementing them with interesting literature-philosophical and anthropological understandings. Appealing to gothic-novel-devotees, literature analysts and cultural anthropologists alike, this book is only in need of an English translation to find its place in the canon of acknowledged vampire-literature.

BENJAMIN HIRSCHFELD  
*University of Tübingen (Germany)*